

FAN Science Watch  
March 28, 2006

**Issue #28: Excerpts from NRC Report**  
by Michael Connett

Last week, the National Research Council (NRC) released its long-awaited review of EPA's safe water standard for fluoride (4 ppm).

As reported by the media, the NRC concluded that EPA's safety standard for fluoride is not safe and "should be lowered." According to the NRC, EPA's "safe" standard (4 ppm) puts a person at increased risk for both tooth and bone damage ("severe dental fluorosis" and bone fracture).

While most of the press coverage so far has focused on NRC's concerns with teeth and bone, there are many other serious concerns expressed in the NRC report.

To give readers an indication of the other concerns expressed by the NRC, we have reproduced a series of excerpts from the report (see below).

The excerpts detail the various systems in the body (e.g. nervous, endocrine, and immune) that fluoride may damage, and how these effects may be enhanced or mediated through fluoride's interactive/synergistic effects with other compounds (e.g. iodine deficiencies and aluminum overload).

When one couples the multitude of serious health concerns expressed by NRC, with their uncertainties on what the various safe vs. toxic doses are, it should cause a great deal of concern.

Here, for example, are what two of the NRC panel members – Dr. Kathleen Thiessen and Dr. Robert Isaacson – had to say about the relevance of NRC's report to the water fluoridation program (see: <http://www.portlandtribune.com/archview.cgi?id=34527> )

However, some of the research that is validated by the report suggests that water-fluoridation levels advocated by Hamilton and Ferre may be unhealthy, two members of the NAS panel said in interviews with the Portland Tribune.

NAS panel member Kathy Thiessen, a former senior scientist at Oak Ridge National Laboratory who has studied fluoride for the EPA, said the report showed "the potential is there" that water fluoridation is unhealthy. As for the studies finding that higher levels damage children's IQ, she said it's possible water fluoridation levels may have a similar, albeit reduced effect. She said in her personal opinion the research suggests "most people should minimize their fluoride intake" — which includes avoiding fluoridated water.

"I think you can look at most chapters of this report and say, 'Whoa,' " she said. "We have made major strides from previous (looks) at this topic."

NAS panel member Robert Isaacson, a distinguished professor of neurobehavioral science at the State University of New York in Binghamton, agreed, saying that the possible effects on endocrines and hormones from water-fluoridation are "something that I wouldn't want to happen to me if I had any say in the matter."

The report "should be a wake-up call," he added.

For more information, and news articles, on NRC's review, see:  
<http://www.fluoridealert.org/health/epa/nrc/index.html>

###

Excerpts from: "*Fluoride in Drinking Water: A Scientific Review of EPA's Standards*" (National Research Council, 2006)

**FLUORIDE'S EFFECTS ON THE BRAIN:**

"On the basis of information largely derived from histological, chemical, and molecular studies, it is apparent that fluorides have the ability to interfere with the functions of the brain and the body by direct and indirect means." p187

"A few epidemiologic studies of Chinese populations have reported IQ deficits in children exposed to fluoride at 2.5 to 4 mg/L in drinking water. Although the studies lacked sufficient detail for the committee to fully assess their quality and relevance to U.S. populations, the consistency of the results appears significant enough to warrant additional research on the effects of fluoride on intelligence." p6

"histopathological changes similar to those traditionally associated with Alzheimer's disease in people have been seen in rats chronically exposed to AIF." p178

"Fluorides also increase the production of free radicals in the brain through several different biological pathways. These changes have a bearing on the possibility that fluorides act to increase the risk of developing Alzheimer's disease." p186

"More research is needed to clarify fluoride's biochemical effects on the brain." p186

"The possibility has been raised by the studies conducted in China that fluoride can lower intellectual abilities. Thus, studies of populations exposed to different concentrations of fluoride in drinking water should include measurements of reasoning ability, problem solving, IQ, and short- and long-term memory." p187

"Studies of populations exposed to different concentrations of fluoride should be undertaken to evaluate neurochemical changes that may be associated with dementia. Consideration should be given to assessing effects from chronic exposure, effects that might be delayed or occur late-in-life, and individual susceptibility." p187

"Additional animal studies designed to evaluate reasoning are needed." p. 187

#### **FLUORIDE'S EFFECTS ON THE ENDOCRINE SYSTEM:**

"In summary, evidence of several types indicates that fluoride affects normal endocrine function or response; the effects of the fluoride-induced changes vary in degree and kind in different individuals. Fluoride is therefore an endocrine disruptor in the broad sense of altering normal endocrine function or response, although probably not in the sense of mimicking a normal hormone. The mechanisms of action remain to be worked out and appear to include both direct and indirect mechanisms, for example, direct stimulation or inhibition of hormone secretion by interference with second messenger function, indirect stimulation or inhibition of hormone secretion by effects on things such as calcium balance, and inhibition of peripheral enzymes that are necessary for activation of the normal hormone." p223

"Some of these [endocrine] effects are associated with fluoride intake that is achievable at fluoride concentrations in drinking water of 4 mg/L or less, especially for young children or for individuals with high water intake. Many of the effects could be considered subclinical effects, meaning that they are not adverse health effects. However, recent work on borderline hormonal imbalances and endocrine-disrupting chemicals indicated that adverse health effects, or increased risks for developing adverse effects, might be associated with seemingly mild imbalances or perturbations in hormone concentrations. Further research is needed to explore these possibilities." p7

"Further effort is necessary to characterize the direct and indirect mechanisms of fluoride's action on the endocrine system and the factors that determine the response, if any, in a given individual." p223

"The effects of fluoride on various aspects of endocrine function should be examined further, particularly with respect to a possible role in the development of several diseases or mental states in the United States." p224

#### **FLUORIDE'S EFFECTS ON THE THYROID:**

"several lines of information indicate an effect of fluoride exposure on thyroid function."  
p197

"it is difficult to predict exactly what effects on thyroid function are likely at what concentration of fluoride exposure and under what circumstances." p197

"Fluoride exposure in humans is associated with elevated TSH concentrations, increased goiter prevalence, and altered T4 and T3 concentrations; similar effects on T4 and T3 are reported in experimental animals." p218

"In humans, effects on thyroid function were associated with fluoride exposures of 0.05-0.13 mg/kg/day when iodine intake was adequate and 0.01-0.03 mg/kg/day when iodine intake was inadequate." p218

"The recent decline in iodine intake in the United States (CDC 2002d; Larsen et al. 2002) could contribute to increased toxicity of fluoride for some individuals." p218

"Intake of nutrients such as calcium and iodine often is not reported in studies of fluoride effects. The effects of fluoride on thyroid function, for instance, might depend on whether iodine intake is low, adequate, or high, or whether dietary selenium is adequate." p222

#### **FLUORIDE'S EFFECTS ON THE PINEAL GLAND:**

"The single animal study of pineal function indicates that fluoride exposure results in altered melatonin production and altered timing of sexual maturity (Table 8-1). Whether fluoride affects pineal function in humans remains to be demonstrated. The two studies of menarcheal age in humans show the possibility of earlier menarche in some individuals exposed to fluoride, but no definitive statement can be made. Recent information on the role of the pineal organ in humans suggests that any agent that affects pineal function could affect human health in a variety of ways, including effects on sexual maturation, calcium metabolism, parathyroid function, postmenopausal osteoporosis, cancer, and psychiatric disease." p221-22

#### **FLUORIDE'S EFFECTS ON INSULIN SECRETION/DIABETES:**

"The conclusion from the available studies is that sufficient fluoride exposure appears to bring about increases in blood glucose or impaired glucose tolerance in some individuals and to increase the severity of some types of diabetes. In general, impaired glucose metabolism appears to be associated with serum or plasma fluoride concentrations of about 0.1 mg/L or greater in both animals and humans. In addition, diabetic individuals will often have higher than normal water intake, and consequently, will have higher than normal fluoride intake for a given concentration of fluoride in drinking water. An estimated 16-20 million people in the U.S. have diabetes mellitus; therefore, any role of fluoride exposure in the development of impaired glucose metabolism or diabetes is potentially significant." p. 217

#### **FLUORIDE'S EFFECTS ON THE IMMUNE SYSTEM:**

"Nevertheless, patients who live in either an artificially fluoridated community or a community where the drinking water naturally contains fluoride at 4 mg/L have all accumulated fluoride in their skeletal systems and potentially have very high fluoride concentrations in their bones. The bone marrow is where immune cells develop and that

could affect humoral immunity and the production of antibodies to foreign chemicals.”  
p249

“There is no question that fluoride can affect the cells involved in providing immune responses. The question is what proportion, if any, of the population consuming drinking water containing fluoride at 4.0 mg/L on a regular basis will have their immune systems compromised? Not a single epidemiologic study has investigated whether fluoride in the drinking water at 4 mg/L is associated with changes in immune function. Nor has any study examined whether a person with an immunodeficiency disease can tolerate fluoride ingestion from drinking water.” p250

“bone concentrates fluoride and the blood-borne progenitors could be exposed to exceptionally high fluoride concentrations. Thus, more research needs to be carried out before one can state that drinking water containing fluoride at 4 mg/L has no effect on the immune system.” p250

“it is important to consider subpopulations that accumulate large concentrations of fluoride in their bones (e.g., renal patients). When bone turnover occurs, the potential exists for immune system cells and stem cells to be exposed to concentrations of fluoride in the interstitial fluids of bone that are higher than would be found in serum. From an immunologic standpoint, individuals who are immunocompromised (e.g., AIDS, transplant, and bone-marrow-replacement patients) could be at greater risk of the immunologic effects of fluoride.” p 258

“Within 250  $\mu$ m of a site of resorption, it is possible to encounter progenitor cells that give rise to bone, blood, and fat. Thus, one must assume that these cells would be exposed to high concentrations of fluoride. At this time, it is not possible to predict what effect this exposure would have on the functioning of skeletal elements, hematopoiesis, and adipose formation.” p115

“It is paramount that careful biochemical studies be conducted to determine what fluoride concentrations occur in the bone and surrounding interstitial fluids from exposure to fluoride in drinking water at up to 4 mg/L, because bone marrow is the source of the progenitors that produce the immune system cells.” p 259

“In addition, studies could be conducted to determine what percentage of immunocompromised subjects have adverse reactions when exposed to fluoride in the range of 1-4 mg/L in drinking water.” p259

#### **FLUORIDE'S INTERACTIVE/SYNERGISTIC EFFECTS (w/ IODINE, ALUMINUM, ETC):**

“Intake of nutrients such as calcium and iodine often is not reported in studies of fluoride effects. The effects of fluoride on thyroid function, for instance, might depend on whether iodine intake is low, adequate, or high, or whether dietary selenium is adequate.” p222

“Better characterization of exposure to fluoride is needed in epidemiology studies investigating potential effects. Important exposure aspects of such studies would include the following: collecting data on general dietary status and dietary factors that could influence exposure or effects, such as calcium, iodine, and aluminum intakes.” p72

“Available information now indicates a role for aluminum in the interaction of fluoride on the second messenger system; thus, differences in aluminum exposure might explain some of the differences in response to fluoride exposures among individuals and populations.” p222

“With the increasing prevalence of acid rain, metal ions such as aluminum become more soluble and enter our day-to-day environment; the opportunity for bioactive forms of AIF to exist has increased in the past 100 years. Human exposure to aluminofluorides can occur

when a person ingests both a fluoride source (e.g., fluoride in drinking water) and an aluminum source; sources of human exposure to aluminum include drinking water, tea, food residues, infant formula, aluminum-containing antacids or medications, deodorants, cosmetics, and glassware.” p42

“Further research should include characterization of both the exposure conditions and the physiological conditions (for fluoride and for aluminum or beryllium) under which aluminofluoride and beryllifluoride complexes can be expected to occur in humans as well as the biological effects that could result.” p42

“Another possible explanation for increased blood lead concentrations which has not been examined is the effect of fluoride intake on calcium metabolism; a review by Goyer (1995) indicates that higher blood and tissue concentrations of lead occur when the diet is low in calcium. Increased fluoride exposure appears to increase the dietary requirement for calcium (see Chapter 8); in addition, the substitution of tap-water based beverages (e.g., soft drinks or reconstituted juices) for dairy products would result in both increased fluoride intake and decreased calcium intake.” p43

“[G]iven the expected presence of fluoride ion (from any fluoridation source) and silica (native to the water) in any fluoridated tap water, it would be useful to examine what happens when that tap water is used to make acidic beverages or products (commercially or in homes), especially fruit juice from concentrate, tea, and soft drinks. Although neither Urbansky (2002) nor Morris (2004) discusses such beverages, both indicate that at pH < 5, SiF<sub>6</sub><sup>2-</sup> would be present, so it seems reasonable to expect that some SiF<sub>6</sub><sup>2-</sup> would be present in acidic beverages but not in the tap water used to prepare the beverages. Consumption rates of these beverages are high for many people, and therefore the possibility of biological effects of SiF<sub>6</sub><sup>2-</sup>, as opposed to free fluoride ion, should be examined.” p44

#### **FLUORIDE'S EFFECTS ON THE REPRODUCTIVE SYSTEM:**

“A few human studies suggested that high concentrations of fluoride exposure might be associated with alterations in reproductive hormones, effects on fertility, and developmental outcomes, but design limitations make those studies insufficient for risk evaluation.” p6

“the relationship between fertility and fluoride requires additional study.” p161

#### **FLUORIDE & DOWNS SYNDROME:**

“The possible association of cytogenetic effects with fluoride exposure suggests that Down's syndrome is a biologically plausible outcome of exposure.” p170

“A reanalysis of data on Down's syndrome and fluoride by Takahashi (1998) suggested a possible association in children born to young mothers. A case-control study of the incidence of Down's syndrome in young women and fluoride exposure would be useful for addressing that issue. However, it may be particularly difficult to study the incidence of Down's syndrome today given increased fetal genetic testing and concerns with confidentiality.” 172

#### **FLUORIDE'S EFFECTS ON THE GASTROINTESTINAL SYSTEM:**

“The numerous fluoridation studies in the past failed to rigorously test for changes in GI symptoms and there are no studies on drinking water containing fluoride at 4 mg/L in which GI symptoms were carefully documented.” p230

“GI effects appear to have been rarely evaluated in the fluoride supplement studies that followed the early ones in the 1950s and 1960s.” p231

"The table suggests that fluoride at 4 mg/L in the drinking water results in approximately 1% of the population experiencing GI symptoms." p231

"Whether fluoride activates G proteins in the gut epithelium at very low doses (e.g., from fluoridated water at 4.0 mg/L) and has significant effects on the gut cell chemistry must be examined in biochemical studies." p236

"There are a few case reports of GI upset in subjects exposed to drinking water fluoridated at 1 mg/L. Those effects were observed in only a small number of cases, which suggest hypersensitivity. However, the available data are not robust enough to determine whether that is the case." p. 250

"Studies are needed to evaluate gastric responses to fluoride from natural sources at concentrations up to 4 mg/L and from artificial sources." p. 258

#### **FLUORIDE'S EFFECTS ON THE LIVER:**

"It is possible that a lifetime ingestion of 5-10 mg/day from drinking water containing 4 mg/L might turn out to have long-term effects on the liver, and this should be investigated in future epidemiologic studies." p248

"The effect of low doses of fluoride on kidney and liver enzyme functions in humans needs to be carefully documented in communities exposed to different concentrations of fluoride in drinking water." p258

#### **FLUORIDE'S EFFECTS ON THE KIDNEY:**

"Human kidneys... concentrate fluoride as much as 50-fold from plasma to urine. Portions of the renal system may therefore be at higher risk of fluoride toxicity than most soft tissues." p236

"Early water fluoridation studies did not carefully assess changes in renal function." p236

"future studies should be directed toward determining whether kidney stone formation is the most sensitive end point on which to base the MCLG." p247

"On the basis of studies carried out on people living in regions where there is endemic fluorosis, ingestion of fluoride at 12 mg per day would increase the risk for some people to develop adverse renal effects." p247

"The effect of low doses of fluoride on kidney and liver enzyme functions in humans needs to be carefully documented in communities exposed to different concentrations of fluoride in drinking water." p258

#### **FLUORIDE & CANCER:**

"Fluoride appears to have the potential to initiate or promote cancers, particularly of the bone, but the evidence to date is tentative and mixed (Tables 10-4 and 10-5). As noted above, osteosarcoma is of particular concern as a potential effect of fluoride because of (1) fluoride deposition in bone, (2) the mitogenic effect of fluoride on bone cells, (3) animal results described above, and (4) pre-1993 publication of some positive, as well as negative, epidemiologic reports on associations of fluoride exposure with osteosarcoma risk." p. 286

"Because fluoride stimulates osteoblast proliferation, there is a theoretical risk that it might induce a malignant change in the expanding cell population. This has raised concerns that fluoride exposure might be an independent risk factor for new osteosarcomas." p109

"Osteosarcoma presents the greatest a priori plausibility as a potential cancer target site because of fluoride's deposition in bone, the NTP animal study findings of borderline increased osteosarcomas in male rats, and the known mitogenic effect of fluoride on bone cells in culture (see Chapter 5). Principles of cell biology indicate that stimuli for rapid cell division increase the risks for some of the dividing cells to become malignant, either by inducing random transforming events or by unmasking malignant cells that previously were in nondividing states." p275

"Further research on a possible effect of fluoride on bladder cancer risk should be conducted." p288